

# CIVIL SERVICE TRAINING POLICY IN CHINA AND ALGERIA: WHAT BENEFITS ALGERIA CAN DERIVE FROM THE CHINESE EXPERIENCE?

---

Tayeb Toufik DAHAR,<sup>1</sup> and YU Zhangquan<sup>2</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*Despite the distance between them, China and Algeria are very close strategically, politically, and economically, as they developed relations that extended to important periods and milestones in the history of the two countries. This comparative study seeks to explore the issue of civil service training as a new area for convergence, exchange of lessons and intensification of cooperation between the two countries. Although the two countries are currently linked with a comprehensive strategic partnership and bilateral cooperation within the framework of the Belt and Road Initiative, the economic and political aspects have always received the greatest focus in cooperation activities. This is in contrast with issues related to civil service and the training of leaders and civil servants, which only received interest in the most recent few years. The authors draw upon broad experience, as both are academics and practitioners in the field of civil service training as well as in capacity building cooperation activities between the two countries.*

**Keywords:** *civil service training, research, and consultation, cooperation between Algeria and China.*

## INTRODUCTION

The development and training of the civil service workforce has continuously been a key topic in the civil service and public administration literature. Several decades ago, comparative studies on the civil service or civil service training were not of particular interest, and the maximum extent to which they could be used was merely to try to convey some experiences or to take some lessons. Gradually things are no longer the same, and many voices have called for the need to expand this kind of research and comparative studies, but according to a very different point of view and purpose. McGregor and Solano, for one, strongly claim that:

*"what makes the recent call for comparative civil service systems knowledge timely is the unscheduled appearance of a large-scale, public problem-solving agenda. The agenda includes global problems that do not respect either current or future national boundaries, the search for winning positions in the economic competitiveness race, and sporadic popular demands for government excellence and performance. Moreover, the agenda is constrained by the reality of fiscal scarcity. For better or worse, a global scrutiny of civil service and public service systems is under way by examiners whose ambitions involve the solving of problems rather than the accumulation of knowledge."*(McGregor Jr and Solano 1994: 94).

The small volume of literature about 'comparative civil service systems', despite apparent differences amongst its authors, make very clear why a strategic examination of their public service systems is required: (i) the external world is pressing challenges and problems on their respective public sectors that cannot be adequately met by continuing static administrative and civil service operations designed for the problems and policies of earlier more stable eras; and (ii) effective public policy and government depend on public activity that is swifter, smarter, and better coordinated than ever before in responding to problems which are bigger, more complex, and constantly changing. Others have often voiced the opinion that future

---

<sup>1</sup> Deputy Director, Ministry of Interior, Algeria; PhD candidate, Algiers University, Doctoral School on State and Public Policy. Email: [daharena@hotmail.com](mailto:daharena@hotmail.com)

<sup>2</sup> Deputy Division Director, Department of International Cooperation, MPA candidate, China National Academy of Governance (CNAG). Email: [yuzhangquan@ccps.gov.cn](mailto:yuzhangquan@ccps.gov.cn)

research in comparative public administration needs to rely more on multiple case analyses in different contexts to produce reliable generalisations that enrich knowledge and elevate practice.

### **RESEARCH QUESTION**

This study tries to address what the convergences and differences are in the policies adopted by China and Algeria for civil service training. To enhance this research question, it is necessary to address some supporting aspects, as the following:

- The historical, political, economic, and social background of the civil service training reform paths in the two countries;
- The challenges the two countries face to adapt the civil service training systems to the requirements of the twenty-first century, especially those related to globalisation, development, technology and building the common destiny of mankind;
- The degree to which the civil service training curricula and reforms adopted by China played a decisive role or affected the rapid development that China has witnessed in recent decades;
- The legal frameworks and the current reforms of the two countries in the field of civil service training;
- Previous experiences, prospects, and possibilities for cooperation between the two countries in the field of civil service training; and
- The degree to which civil service training is compatible with the spirit of partnership under the Belt and Road Initiative.

### **HYPOTHESIS**

- Each country has its own background and challenges that have shaped the nature and content of the prevailing civil service training system;
- Public policies and development strategies depend mainly on the quality of training that leaders, cadres, and civil servants receive;
- The rapid development that China has experienced in all fields deserves the Algerian experience to benefit from in terms of the role played by the civil service training curricula;
- The effectiveness of the external development strategies pursued by China, especially within the framework of the Belt and Road Initiative, depends on the availability of leaders and civil servants in the countries involved, who have a long-term view of the new international context for development and governance.

### **ON CHINESE CIVIL SERVANTS TRAINING**

In China, civil servants are the main force of public management and the bridge between the Communist Party of China (CPC), the Government, and the people. The training of civil servants is of great significance for developing public human resources, promoting the excellence in civil service, and serving the central tasks of the CPC and the state.

#### **The status-quo of China's civil service**

China's Civil Service Law points out that the term “civil servants” refers to staff who perform public duties according to the law, are included in the national administrative establishment,

and are paid wages and benefits by the state budget. They are an important part of the Chinese cadre team,<sup>3</sup> the backbone of the socialist cause, and the public servants of the people. At present, there are 8,523 million civil servants in China, including 1.09 million staff members of mass organisations and institutions, which are also publicly managed.

China does not distinguish between political officials and administrative officials. The Civil Service Law clearly states that the staff of authorities of the CPC at all levels, people's congresses and their standing committees at all levels, administrative authorities at all levels, committees at all levels of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference, supervisory authorities at all levels, judicial authorities at all levels, procurator authorities at all levels, democratic parties and federations of industry and commerce at all levels, except the contracted workers, are all included in the civil service.

The Civil Service Law that came into effect in 2006 has greatly optimised the structure of civil service group. The civil service examination system adheres to the principle of every entry must be based on tests, which ensures the high quality of the civil service candidate group from the beginning, and greatly optimises the source, experience, major, and educational background of civil servants. The proportion of those with bachelor degrees or above in the civil service increased from 43% in 2006 to 71.9% in 2017. The proportion of under 35 years old increased from 25.6% to 27.8%. The proportion of women increased from 22.8% to 26.5%.<sup>4</sup>

### **Historical evolution of China's civil servants' training**

The training of civil servants in China has just over 30 years' development since China established its civil service system. Over that period, by absorbing the experience of previous cadre education and training (CET) and the excellent practices of developed countries, the training of civil servants in China has been continuously reformed, innovated, and improved day by day, providing a strong organisational guarantee for the CPC and the country to do a good job on the central tasks of different periods.

In 1987, the 13<sup>th</sup> National Congress of the CPC decided to establish a civil service system in China and proposed the establishment of national and local academies of governance. In 1993, the National Provisional Regulations on Civil Servants were promulgated, and the training of civil servants became the focus of cadre training. In 1994, the China National Academy of Governance was established, which undertook the training tasks of senior civil servants at provincial and ministerial levels and department levels and some outstanding reserve officials. Since then, the National Interim Provisions on the Training of Civil Servants Abroad (1995) and the National Interim Provisions on the Training of Civil Servants (1996) have been promulgated, and the training system of Chinese civil servants has become increasingly standardised.

The world's political and economic situation in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century and the country's accession to the WTO in 2001 has led China to select senior- and middle-level civil servants to undergo training in developed countries, so they can meet the challenges of economic globalisation to government functions. After the 16<sup>th</sup> National Congress of the CPC in 2002, the CPC Central Committee assessed the situation and emphasised that China should concentrate on training

---

<sup>3</sup> In China, the term "cadre" is different from "civil servant". The scope of the term cadres is wider than that the term civil servants. All civil servants are cadres, but they are not a large group among the group of cadres.

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.12371.cn/2018/12/30/ARTI1546150894993248.shtml>

in its strive to build a high-quality cadre personnel. In order to further optimise the overall layout of civil service training institutions, the central government intensified the construction of relevant infrastructure and the integration of educational resources. In March 2005, the CPC established the China Executive Leadership Academy in Pudong(CELAP), the China Executive Leadership Academy in Jinggangshan(CELAJ), and the China Executive Leadership Academy in Yan 'an(CELAY). All these establishments aimed at building the basis for education on revolutionary tradition and on national conditions and becoming the melting pot for improving the quality and skills of leading cadres, and a window for international training exchanges and cooperation.

Additionally, the China Business Executive Academy in Dalian(CBEAD) was established in 2006, responsible for the training of leaders, reserve leaders and strategic reserve personnel of key state-owned enterprises and financial institutions, as well as leaders and key teachers of training entities in national enterprise. These four academies, together with the Party School of the Central Committee of CPC and the China National Academy of Governance, constitute the national CET system.

The Civil Service Law of the People's Republic of China, which was implemented in January 2006, established a legal status, and unveiled a new chapter for civil servants' training in China. In the same year, the CPC Central Committee promulgated the Regulation on Cadre Education and Training (Trial), which laid the foundation for the national CET work. In June 2008, the Organisation Department of the CPC Central Committee and the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security jointly promulgated the Regulation on Civil Servants Training (Trial), and in 2009, the State Council promulgated the Regulation on the Work of Academies of Governance, which marked that China has set up a nation-wide civil servant training system.<sup>5</sup>

The 18<sup>th</sup> National Congress of the CPC (in 2012) started a new journey of China's civil servants' training. Since then, Xi Jinping, Secretary-General of the CPC Central Committee, has delivered a series of important speeches, providing the ideological rationale and action guidelines for excelling in CET in this new era. The CPC and the government summed up and institutionalised the practical experience of CET in a timely manner. In October 2015, the revised Regulation on Cadre Education and Training was issued. The Regulation clearly states the necessity to carry out CET congruent with the strategic goals of building a well-off society in an all-round way, comprehensively deepening reform, comprehensively governing the country according to law and strictly administering the CPC in an all-round way, promoting the modernisation of the national governance system and governance capacity, and providing ideological and political support, talent reserve and intellectual support for continuously winning new victories of socialism with Chinese characteristics and realising the Chinese dream of the great rejuvenation of the Chinese nation.<sup>6</sup> The new Regulations follow the spirit of the central government and are implemented based on the achievements of reform and innovation, emphasising problem solving approaches, and improving the system and

---

<sup>5</sup> In addition, institutions of higher education, research institutes, non-governmental training institutions and overseas institutions also carry out some training tasks on a supplementary basis.

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.12371.cn/2018/12/30/ARTI1546150894993248.shtml>

mechanism of CET, becoming the latest institutional achievements of the CPC in CET, and constituting the fundamental guidelines for excelling in CET in the new reality.

In March 2018, the CPC Central Committee made the decision to combine the Party School of the Central Committee of CPC and the National Academy of Governance. The new institution was named the Party School of the Central Committee of CPC (China National Academy of Governance) [CCPS (CNAG)], thus opening a new chapter in such education and training. The National CET Plan for 2018-2022 was issued in November 2018, the new Civil Service Law was promulgated in June 2019, and the revised Regulation on Civil Servants Training was issued in November of the same year. These laws and regulations clearly stipulate the core tasks, objectives, contents, methods, and ways of civil servant training in the new era.

### **Main basis for the training of Chinese civil servants**

The above-mentioned laws and regulations define the management and operational system of civil servants training. Such training is coordinated by the Organisation Department of the CPC Central Committee, the relevant departments of the central government, and the central and local governments manage this task at different levels, forming a training system with vertical and horizontal complementarity, with horizontal training being the backbone of the whole system. Horizontal training mainly refers to the training organised by the Organisation Department of the CPC Central Committee and the Organisation Department of Local Party Committees respectively, reflecting the relationship of hierarchical management. Vertical training mainly refers to the training organised by national and local ministries and commissions and professional (industry-based) departments. The Regulation on Cadre Education and Training (in 2015) and the Regulation on Civil Servants Training (in 2019), together with the Five-Year Plan for National CET, clearly stipulate such education and training, especially the civil servants training, in guiding ideology, basic principles, training contents, training methods, training institutions, curriculum materials, assessment and evaluation, and serve as a fundamental guide for all CET activities.

Additionally, these laws and regulations stipulate that all Chinese civil servants have the right and obligation to receive training. First, they put forward the principle of training participated by all, emphasising that all civil servants should join in this process. Second, the quantitative requirements are clearly defined, stipulating that civil servants holding leadership positions at or above the county level should participate in the training of Party schools (academies of governance), leadership academies, and other training institutions recognised by the competent departments of civil servants or the authorities where civil servants are located.<sup>7</sup> Third, they outline safeguard measures. Thus, civil servants' employers are required to complete the training tasks according to the plan, support and encourage civil servants to study on the job and provide the necessary conditions.<sup>8</sup> Fourth, they provide for checking

---

<sup>7</sup> Training lasts for a total of 3 months or more than 550 hours every 5 years. Other civil servants should generally participate in training for no less than 12 days or 90 hours every year.

<sup>8</sup> It is stipulated that during the off-the-job training period selected by the organisation according to regulations, the salary and various welfare benefits of civil servants are the same as those of on-the-job personnel, and trainees generally do not undertake the daily work of the departments where they work, including overseas visits and other tasks.

mechanisms. Thus, it is stipulated that civil servants should obey the training arrangements, abide by the rules and regulations of training, and complete the prescribed training tasks.

Newly recruited civil servants who did not participate in the initial training or failed the initial training examination cannot be given ranks. Civil servants who did not participate in the job training or failed the job training examination shall be reprimanded according to different situations and relevant regulations. Civil servants who fail to pass the examination of specialised training shall not engage in specialised work. Civil servants who fail to participate in the training according to regulations or fail to meet the training requirements for some reason shall make up the training in time. Those who do not participate in the training without justifiable reasons and violate the relevant provisions and disciplines shall be given corresponding punishment according to the seriousness of the case. The training situation and academic performance of civil servants are regarded as one of the contents of civil servants' assessment and the basis for appointment and promotion. If the training assessment fails, their annual assessment shall not be able to receive excellent grades.<sup>9</sup>

### **Main contents and characteristics of the training of Chinese civil servants**

#### ***(1) Focusing on the scale, and improving both quality and efficiency***

The Regulation on Cadre Education and Training focuses on the large-scale training of cadres, highlights the need to improve quality and efficiency in an all-round way, and makes specific provisions on teaching according to needs, doing a good job in demand research, improving ways and means, enhancing attractiveness and appeal, improving the assessment system, and strictly evaluating quality.

First, on training according to needs, emphasis is placed on following the laws of cadre development, education, and training, prioritising organisational needs and post-related needs, while considering the individual needs of cadres, combining the universal requirements of education and training with the needs of cadres of different categories, levels and posts, and carrying out education and training in a targeted manner. For instance, civil servants of comprehensive management are provided with training on improving public management and service. Conversely, professional, and technical civil servants are trained on professional knowledge and skills and administrative law enforcement civil servants are trained on laws and regulations and law enforcement skills. Furthermore, leading civil servants are trained on the ability of policy making, investigation and research, etc and frontline civil servants are trained on social management, communication and serving the people and other training enhancing their capacities.<sup>10</sup>

Second, paying attention to keeping pace with the times, the practice and development of Chinese civil servants' training constantly innovates and meets the needs of the times. For this reason, in line with the development requirements of various stages of development, the CELAP, CELAY, CELAJ, CBEAD and other CET institutes have been established respectively to improve the national CET system. They continuously innovate training methods by clearly guiding and supporting the innovation of training methods.<sup>11</sup> According to the National CET

---

<sup>9</sup> [http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108\\_16200.html](http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108_16200.html)

<sup>10</sup> [http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108\\_16200.html](http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108_16200.html)

<sup>11</sup> It is emphasised that teaching methods, such as class lectures, discussion, case study, simulation, and experience, should be applied according to the content requirements and the characteristics of civil servants in training.

Plan for 2018-2022, the proportion of courses using interactive teaching methods such as discussion, case study, simulation, experience, and debate in the main branches of Party schools (academies of governance), cadre academies and socialist academies at or above the provincial level is not less than 30%.<sup>12</sup>

In addition, Chinese practitioners also actively learn from and apply advanced methods abroad. For example, the National Academy of Governance also uses action learning and segmented training methods, structured discussion, etc., helping civil servants to combine the theoretical knowledge obtained from training with practical work, with better practical results.

Third, the development of a large-scale cadre network training platform has culminated to establishing online training academies for civil servants at all levels, enrich their training content, and expand the functions of online training platforms by including online forums, interactive answering questions, personalised tests, live broadcasts, and typical case databases. In this context, CCPS (CNAG) has built its Online Training School, which provides high-quality curriculum resources for its trainees and teachers and the network of party schools (academies of governance), provides high-quality theoretical education and Party ideological education courses for the public, and publicises distinguished teachers' courses in the CPC party school (academy of governance) system.

Also, meeting the needs of the new situation and continuously deepening and expanding the training field. Since the 18<sup>th</sup> CPC National Congress, the training of civil servants constantly strengthens the education of global and domestic policies and new trends, implements the new development concept, deepens the supply-side structural reform, implements national strategies, and promotes the construction of the "Belt and Road Initiative" (BRI) and other major policy directives of the CPC Central Committee.

Likewise, attaching importance to training capacity building of educators. Thus, it focuses on teaching, deepening teaching reform, improving training content, scientifically setting training frequency and educational system, and improving teaching quality. It establishes a high-quality teaching staff including full-time and part-time teachers, a mechanism for updating the knowledge of full-time teachers and practical training system, and it establishes and improves the system of leading cadres serving as teachers. Furthermore, it establishes and improves the developing and renewal mechanism of training curriculum, and an open, diverse and effective civil servant training material system. The funds needed for the training of civil servants are included in the annual budgets of governments at all levels, and gradually increase along with the budgetary fiscal revenue growth. Priority is given to ensuring important training programmes, e.g., increasing support for the educating and training of cadres in old revolutionary areas, ethnic minority areas, border areas and poverty-stricken areas, and promote the extension of high-quality training resources to the grassroots level.<sup>13</sup>

The fourth is the combination of training, research, and consultation. Cadre training institutions of all levels and types organically integrate training with research consultation. Full-time teaching and research personnel not only teach, but also actively carry out research on philosophy and social science, leading to many achievements, serving Party committees and governments at all levels, and playing the functions as academic centres and think tanks.

---

<sup>12</sup> <http://www.12371.cn/2018/11/09/ARTI1541718755865327.shtml>

<sup>13</sup> [http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108\\_16200.html](http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108_16200.html)

In addition, the trainees also made important contributions to research and consultation. The trainees are all Party and government cadres with theoretical and practical experience, especially senior civil servants. They have profound theoretical literacy and rich practical experience, with a profound understanding of key, difficult and hot issues in practice. When they come to training institutions to study, they "recharge" themselves and participate in seminars, forums, field investigations, etc according to the requirements of training institutions, and write summary reports and consultation documents, so as to condense their experience and wisdom into policy suggestions and provide important support for the central government's decision-making.

## *(2) Continuously improving the training operation system*

A good training operation system usually includes good content, methods, and implementors. China has made continuous efforts to improve its training operation system during the course of its development.

Firstly, on the content of China's civil servants training. It mainly includes political theory education, policies and regulations education, professional knowledge training, scientific and humanistic quality education highlighting political quality, cultivating the professional ability and spirit of civil servants, and thus improving the system execution and governance ability.

Political theory education focuses on the theoretical foundation of socialism with Chinese characteristics and the CPC's theory, lines, principles and policies, education of ideals and beliefs, Party history, history of the People's Republic of China, history of reform and opening-up, and history of socialist development. Education of policies and regulations focuses on strengthening the education of constitutional laws and inner-Party laws and regulations and carrying out the training of the CPC Central Committee on major policies on economic, political, cultural and social development, as well as on ecological preservation and Party building, so as to improve the management of civil servants.

The content also includes education on the overall national security concept, to enhance civil servants' awareness of national security and strengthen their ability to protecting national security. Furthermore, it includes business knowledge training, according to the post characteristics and work requirements, and it targets training on necessary ability and quality, knowledge system, clean government warning and professional ethics to help civil servants improve their professional quality and practical work ability and improve their ability to implement the major decisions and arrangements of the CPC Central Committee. Education on scientific and humanistic quality includes education and training in philosophy, history, science and technology, literature, art and military, diplomacy, nationality, religion, confidentiality, mental health, and other aspects, to help civil servants speed up their knowledge updating, optimise their knowledge structure, broaden their horizons and improve their comprehensive capacity.

Secondly, on the training methods and types. The training of Chinese civil servants includes full-time training, self-learning of optional courses, online training and on-the-job self-study. Off-the-job training is mainly organised by the superior authorities. Training is mainly divided

into 4 types, i.e., initial training, on-the-job training, specialised professional training, and on-the-job training.<sup>14</sup>

Initial training is provided for newly recruited civil servants and it focuses on improving their ideological and political quality and their ability to adapt to the work of government agencies, such as acting in accordance with laws and regulations. The initial training is completed during the probation period, and generally lasts not less than 12 days.

On-the-job training, which is provided according to the requirements of new positions. The training of civil servants promoted to leadership positions focuses on improving their political and leadership ability. The training time for civil servants holding leadership positions at or above the county level is generally not less than 30 days, and that for civil servants at the township level is generally not less than 15 days.

Specialised professional training: professional knowledge and skills training is provided according to the needs of civil servants engaged in special work, focusing on improving their professional work ability. The time and requirements of training are determined by the authorities where civil servants work according to their needs. The central authority of civil servants has strengthened macro guidance on the specialised professional training of professional and technical civil servants and civil servants enforcing laws and administrative rules.

On-the-job training is provided for all civil servants to learn and understand the decision-making arrangements of the CPC Central Committee in time, improve political quality and working ability, and update knowledge, focusing on enhancing the systematic, continuity, pertinence and effectiveness of the quality and ability training of civil servants. The time and requirements are determined by the authority of civil servant management at all levels and the departments where civil servants are located according to needs.

In addition, there are some other training in practice, such as training for outstanding young civil servants, special training for frontline civil servants, counterpart training for regions with insufficient development such as the Western part of China, training in developed countries and regions, and MPA degree education.

Thirdly, on the training institutional system. The civil servants' training institutional system has been formed with Party schools (academies of governance) and cadre academies at all levels as the main channels, supplemented by civil servant training institutions in departments and industries, institutions of higher education, research institutes, social training institutions and training institutions outside the Chinese mainland.

Here is a brief introduction to the CCPS (CNAG) since it is the most important cadre training and education institute in China. It mainly undertakes four functions: first, personnel training, training of senior and middle-level leading cadres of the CPC and the Chinese government and outstanding young and middle-aged cadres; second, theoretical construction, focusing on theoretical research, education and academic exchange, as well as research on socialism with Chinese characteristics; third, as an important philosophy and social science research institution of the CPC and the Central Government, it extensively carries out multi-

---

<sup>14</sup> [http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108\\_16200.html](http://www.scs.gov.cn/zcfg/202001/t20200108_16200.html)

disciplinary and multi-field research on philosophy and social science; fourth, decision-making consultation, as an important high-end think tank, it has provided theoretical support and policy suggestions for a series of major decisions of the CPC and the central government for a long time, and many suggestions have been fully adopted.<sup>15</sup>

The teaching of CCPS (CNAG) focuses on learning Xi Jinping's thoughts on socialism with Chinese characteristics in the new era, improving the leadership quality and ruling ability of Party members and leading cadres, mastering the latest achievements of theoretical innovation and consolidating the theoretical foundation of trainees, grasping the characteristics of the times and the international economic and political situation, and expanding the trainees' global vision. It also focuses on strengthening the awareness of overall situation and dealing with complex situations, cultivating trainees' strategic thinking, strengthening ideals and beliefs, enhancing the concept of purpose and improving the style of work, and strengthening the CPC spirit cultivation of the trainees. In accordance with this focus, a curriculum has been formed that includes theoretical education and Party spirit education as the core courses, complemented by education on the world situation, the imperatives to focus on, training on governance ability and knowledge dissemination.

Education and training activities of the CCPS (CNAG) are carried out in different programmes for different trainees. Four types of programmes exist in general: refresher programmes, advanced training programmes, special seminars, and teacher training courses. Continuing education programmes are on-the-job rotation training, mainly targeting leading cadres at all levels.<sup>16</sup> The length of refresher programmes is usually 2 to 3 months. Advanced training programmes focus on systematically training leading cadres on the CPC's basic theory, on leadership and capacity to manage before they assume their posts, so that they possess the corresponding qualifications and competencies for the job. They include programmes for young and middle-aged cadres and training programmes for cadres of ethnic minorities. The special seminars focus on the major strategic arrangements in the economic and social development of the CPC and the country and the CPC's construction, to resolve major issues confronted in the practice of building socialism with Chinese characteristics, and to facilitate the key tasks of the government.<sup>17</sup> Participants of special seminars are mainly leading cadres at the provincial ministerial and department levels. Last, the teacher training courses aim to improve the political quality and professional level of teaching and research of management staff and teachers in local Party schools (academies of governance). They are delivered

---

<sup>15</sup> Mao Zedong, Liu Shaoqi, Hu Jintao and Xi Jinping, the important leaders of the CPC and the country in different periods, all served as presidents of the Party School of the CPC Central Committee. Before the merger, the position of the president of the China National Academy of Governance was always concurrently held by the leading comrades of the State Council. At present, the president of the newly established Party School of the CPC Central Committee (China National Academy of Governance) is Chen Xi, member of the Political Bureau of the Central Committee, Secretary of the Secretariat of the Central Committee and Minister of the Organisation Department of the Central Committee of CPC.

<sup>16</sup> CCPS (CNAG) mainly trains leading cadres at provincial and ministerial levels, leading cadres at department level and county (city) Party secretaries in rotation.

<sup>17</sup> Every year, the CCPS (CNAG) and relevant central and state authorities hold a series of special seminars to carry out discussions and exchanges around the major policy directives and special work of the CPC Central Committee and the State Council, to achieve the goal of reaching a consensus and promoting its work.

regularly for the core staff of teaching and research management and for teachers in Party schools (academies of governance).

The CCPS (CNAG) also provides master's, doctor's, and postgraduate programmes. It has trained many outstanding postgraduates over the years. The school also actively carries out international cooperation and academic exchanges. By the end of 2019, it had established cooperative relations with 305 institutions and 21 international and multilateral organisations in 94 countries and regions and has held more than 500 training programmes for foreign officials in China, covering 164 countries around the world.

### *(3) Focusing on strengthening the evaluation of training effect*

China recognises that evaluation is a necessary part of the training process. The relevant laws and regulations stipulate that the learning and effect levels of training should be evaluated, reflecting the importance attached to training evaluation and the application of evaluation results. The assessment of civil servants' training is generally implemented by the training organizers or institutions, and the assessment is shared with the civil servant's institutions in a timely manner. The assessment criteria include civil servants' learning attitude and performance, their mastery of theory and knowledge, their cultivation of Party spirit and style, and their ability to solve practical problems. The training and academic performance ratings constitute one of the factors considered for appointment and promotion of civil servants.

For training institutions, it is stipulated that the authorities of civil servants are responsible for evaluating civil service training institutions, and the evaluation contents mainly include school-running policies, training quality, teaching staff, organization and management, study atmosphere construction, infrastructure, financial support, etc. The evaluation results are used to guide training institutions to improve their work and serve as an important basis for determining if training institutions could undertake training tasks, and for guiding teaching Department and teachers to improve their teaching. For training programmes, it is stipulated that the organizers of civil service training shall evaluate the training courses or entrust training institutions to carry out the evaluation. The evaluation contents mainly include training design, implementation, management, effect, etc. The evaluation results serve as an important basis for improving training work and improving training quality.

It should be pointed out that the evaluation of the effect of the Chinese civil servants' training tends to be ignored due to operational difficulties - although policy makers and organizational implementers in practice have recognized its importance and necessity - resulting to unscientific assessment methods. The training effect is currently only reflected in short-term assessment tools such as examinations, tests, papers, subjective evaluations, summaries, and appraisal, etc. Long-term follow-up and all-round assessment of the training effects on trainees are rarely observed, and the effect of the training to the trainees' personal ability and their organisations' performance cannot be fully detected.

Training managers at all levels only pay attention to the number of training programmes, the learning process, the use of funds and how to improve training methods and techniques. More policies and reform are needed to improve the evaluation process of training. For example, establishing awareness that training effect evaluation is a necessary and key link in training, which should improve the power of training institutions to make suggestions to the organisation and personnel departments in personal development matters such as selecting

and employing, assessing, and promoting civil servants. The results of training effect evaluation should also be applied to rewards and punishments for individual civil servants, recognition or rectification of training programmes and training institutions, Short-term evaluation methods and long-term follow-up evaluation methods should be combined to effectively help trainees and organisations obtain considerable benefits in further development of the training function.

### **CIVIL SERVICE TRAINING IN ALGERIA: DETERMINANT FACTORS**

The second part of this study highlights the Algerian experience, relying on 10 factors that according to the literature may measure the effectiveness of a country's civil servants training system (Allam 1990; Kerrigan & Luke 1987):

- (1) the presence of a central coordinating agency as well as written and operational civil service training policies;
- (2) the linkage of training to research and consultancy;
- (3) the commitment of policymakers and senior officials to civil service training;
- (4) the continuity of Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) of training programmes;
- (5) the adequacy and reliability of financial resources for training;
- (6) the presence of motivated, qualified, and experienced trainers;
- (7) the presence of local and international linkages;
- (8) the legal foundations for civil service training;
- (9) the structure, nature, and size of the civil service system; and
- (10) the institutions of civil service training.<sup>18</sup>

### **Macro Determinants of Civil Service Training in Algeria: Analysis of Legal and Regulatory Frameworks**

#### ***a. An overview of some elements of the Civil Service Act in Algeria, which are necessary to understand the civil service training system:***

The Algerian Civil Service Act defines a civil servant as every person appointed and assigned to a permanent public position at the level of public institutions and administrations.<sup>19</sup> Civil servants are classified according to their management levels or roles, or the educational levels. Historically, Algeria has adopted a "Career-based System" since the first Civil Service Act was promulgated in 1966. However, forty years later, in 2006, a new Civil Service Act was passed, currently in force. The new Act introduced a dual system; a parallel statutory career-based and position-based system. The career-based system is governed by statutes and an elaborate set of different specialised careers, while the position-based system is governed by contracts.<sup>20</sup> The contract-based system includes service or maintenance positions such as guards, drivers,

---

<sup>18</sup> The latter three factors have been added to the list assuming their relevance to the Algerian setting.

<sup>19</sup> Except for judges, military and civil servants of the national defence, and workers of the Parliament, who are subject to special laws. Furthermore, among the civilian staff, there are categories with exceptional rules in the field of rights, duties, career, and general discipline, such as police, customs, communications security, etc.

<sup>20</sup> However, this system is not a full position-based system as in the case of Algeria applies only to lower level, lower skills positions and not to the whole civil service. In fact, the figures indicate that the "statutory career-based" system is composed of the majority of civil servants in Algeria. Thus, of the 2,160,836 civil servants counted in 2019, 78% are subject to the "statutory career-based" system and the remaining 21% are under the contract system.

or cleaners (Civil Service Act, Art. 19). However, contract-based recruitment may also be used, on an exceptional basis, to ensure work of a temporary nature (Art. 21).

In terms of the levels of management, there is a distinction between "high-level state jobs" and "high-level positions". Without considering the literal meaning of these designations, these two categories, respectively, refer to both senior and middle-level positions. The role of the senior level positions is to exercise responsibility on behalf of the State with the aim of directly contributing to the conception, preparation, and implementation of public policies (Civil Service Act, Art. 15), and their holders are appointed by the President of the Republic (by presidential decree) or the Prime Minister (by executive decree).<sup>21</sup> Conversely, the role of the middle-level positions is to ensure supervision of certain administrative and technical activities in public institutions and departments (Civil Service Act, Art. 10), and are, in most cases, appointed by leaders of public institutions and departments.

**Table 1: Number of civil service regulations and positions grouped by Sectors**

Sector	Number of positions	Number of specific regulations	Sector	Number of positions	Number of specific regulations
Health	127	10	Religious Affairs	15	1
Interior and local authorities	105	4	Youth and sports sector	14	1
Tertiary education and Scientific Research	86	5	Commerce	14	1
Common to all sectors	83	3	Industry	13	2
Finance	54	6	Environment	12	1
Culture	45	1	Water resources	12	1
National solidarity	43	1	Civil Service	9	1
Agriculture and fisheries	35	4	Agriculture, rural development, and fisheries	7	1
Education	29	1	Tourism and crafts industry	6	2
Vocational education and training	26	1	National institutions	6	1
Postal, information and communication technologies	26	1	Energy and Mines	6	1
Public Works and Transport	18	2	Labour and social security	5	1
Justice	16	2	Foreign Affairs	4	1
Housing	15	1	<b>Total</b>	<b>831</b>	<b>57</b>

Source: Prepared by the author based on the data of all specific civil service regulations of Algeria.

On the other hand, civil servants are classified by education level into 4 groups: (A) University degree holders with policy design tasks; (B) Vocational education degree holders (post-secondary), such as technicians in various disciplines; (C) civil servants with a level of basic vocational training required for the exercise of control activities for certain professions, such as technical personnel in electricity or mechanics; and (D) civil servants with basic, primary or

<sup>21</sup> The distribution of appointment powers between the President of the Republic and the Prime Minister in this field is determined by the Constitution and the Presidential Decree No 20-39 (20 February 2020) "On Appointment to the Civil and Military Functions of the State".

no level of education required for the implementation of activities, which most often require physical capacity to carry out.

In addition to the general rules contained in the Civil Service Act, Algeria has 57 special statutes (by-laws) on the civil service for different sectors and disciplines, covering 831 positions across 27 sectors. This demonstrates the difficulty in studying this topic, because of the large number of positions and areas of specialisation and their apparent asymmetries.

***b. The main rules and principles for training under the Civil Service Act of Algeria:***

The Civil Service Act of 2006 addresses the question of training, from different aspects and angles, i.e., (1) considering it as a right of civil servants and as an obligation of the State, institutions, and public administrations; (2) linking it with conditions of recruitment and promotion; (3) identifying privileges and opportunities granted by training to civil servants; and (4) identifying procedures and bodies responsible for developing training strategies and plans.

***(1) Right to training***

In Algeria, the right and/or obligation of civil servants to undergo training are stated in Article 38 of the Civil Service Act, which provides that: *"Civil servants have the right to training, development and promotion throughout their career"*. This article is listed in "Chapter 1: Guarantees and Rights of Civil servants" and is considered as a general principle and a right of all civil servants. Furthermore, Article 104, in "Chapter 5: Training" provides that: *"The administration shall, on a permanent basis, organise training and development courses, to ensure the improvement of the civil servants' qualifications and professional promotion and their preparation for new tasks."*. While this remains only a general rule, Article 105, in the same chapter, refers to the by-laws (civil service training act and specific civil service decrees) to determine *"conditions of access, the organisational arrangements, the duration of training and development courses and the resulting rights and obligations of the civil servant"*.

Moreover, the Civil Service Act provides for the possibility of longer periods of educational leave, to attain further education or attend specific training programmes, given certain prerequisites are fulfilled. This right is referred to in Article 134 of the Civil Service Act, which stipulates that: *"The secondment of civil servants shall be automatically pronounced, with the force of law to enable them to pursue training imposed by special civil service statutes, or to carry out training or studies. This case concerns the training initiated by the employer, otherwise the civil servant may request the 'layoff position for personal-purpose', as will be noted below. According to the Algerian Civil Service Act, when civil servants are on secondment, they continue to be paid and the period of secondment is considered as effective experience (Article 137).*

The case referred to above, means that civil servants have the right to be completely off work, while on full-time study or training. It also means that civil servants pursue further study or trainings without losing their salary, as they are considered employed, in accordance with Article 208 of the Civil Service Act, which states that *"a civil servant can have a permission of absence, without loss of salary, to pursue studies related to his or her tasks, within four (4) hours per week, .... or to participate in exams or competitions for a period equal to the duration it takes."*

In other words, these rights mean that civil servants do not lose their salary while in training or following long-term studies, as it is linked to civil servants being appointed by their

respective administration and assumed that the subject of training or studies is relevant to their duties. Are these the only cases that enable civil servants to pursue training or further studies? The answer is no, as civil servants also have the right to undertake studies, pursue training or conduct research work, on their own initiative, however, in this case, their salary is suspended, but civil servants still reserve the right to return to their position upon completion of study or training. This option is called a '*layoff position for personal-purpose*' and is found in Article 148 of the Civil Service Act, which stipulates that: "*The lay-off for personal convenience, in particular to carry out studies or research work, may be granted at the request of the civil servant, after two (2) years of effective service*". This opportunity is granted for a minimum period of six (6) months, renewable, up to a maximum of (2) years (Art. 149, par. 2).

Finally, it may be worth mentioning that civil servants have the right to provide training or teach in educational institutions as secondary activity. This is undoubtedly an important point, as it is the only exception allowed by the Algerian Civil Service Act (Art. 43, par. 2) for civil servants to engage in another gainful activity; something categorically forbidden for all civil servants as a general principle (Art. 43, par. 1). In addition, the right of civil servants to produce scientific, literary, or artistic works is recognised (Art. 43, par. 3). This is very motivating for civil servants and will enable civil service training institutions to benefit from the experience and expertise of civil servants, as they can contribute to the overall training effort.

## ***(2) Statutory and Mandatory Training: linking training to recruitment and career development***

As a general principle, access to civil servants' grades (ranks) depends on proof of qualification with certificates, diplomas, or level of training (Art. 79). More precisely, there are four ways to join the public service: (1) competitive examinations; (2) competition based on certificates; (3) professional examination; or (4) direct recruitment among candidates who have undergone specialised training, created by the special statutory by-laws, delivered by approved training institutions (Art. 80). Thus, in some cases, the "specialised training" of accredited civil service training institutions may be a mandatory requirement for recruiting certain civil service positions.

In addition to the "specialised training" mentioned above, taking place in the pre-recruitment stage, the Civil Service Act of 2006 established another type of training to be conducted immediately after recruitment, for some government bodies and grades, called "*preparatory training*" for confirmation of trainees as civil servants. It should be made clear here that the status of "trainee" is defined in the Algerian Civil Service Act as the civil servant whose final appointment has not been confirmed, and this confirmation is made after a year of employment. This issue is addressed in Article 84, which states: "*The trainee is required, according to the nature of the tasks inherent in the grade to which he is intended to belong, to complete a probationary period of one year which may, for some bodies, be accompanied by training preparatory to the occupation of the job*".

When examining several specific regulations for certain categories of the civil service, it is found that in some cases this type of training may last between 3 and 6 months; which is, of course, mandatory, and the recruitment as a civil servant cannot be confirmed without successful completion of such training. Furthermore, the Civil Service Act of 2006 provides new rules for promotion to a higher level, based on training and educational level, in three

cases: (1) Promotion based on diplomas;<sup>22</sup> (2) Promotion based on successful completion of specialised training;<sup>23</sup> and (3) Complementary training prior to promotion.<sup>24</sup>

The various types of training mentioned above whether related to recruitment or promotion, have been widely applied in the various specific civil service regulations issued after the Civil Service Act of 2006 (57 as mentioned above), because of their mandatory nature.<sup>25</sup>

### ***(3) Measures and bodies responsible for planning and implementing civil service training policies***

The Civil Service Act of 2006 referred to several bodies and measures for planning, implementing, and evaluating civil service training policies. With respect to bodies, particular reference is made to the Supreme Council for the Civil Service, the central structure of the civil service and the various sectors represented in the ministries and their civil service training institutions. With respect to measures, the focus is on the policies of workforce planning expressed through human resources management annual plans and annual or multi-annual plans for training and development.

According to Articles 58 and 59 of the Civil Service Act, the Supreme Council of the Civil Service is a consultative body, whose task is to identify the major aspects of government policy in the field of civil service, and to determine the civil service training and development policy. The Council is chaired by the Prime Minister and comprises 25 members, including 10 Ministers (Interior and Local Authorities, Justice, Finance, National Education, Higher Education, etc), the Director-General of the Civil Service, the Director-General of the National School of Administration (ENA), and representatives of local authorities, labour unions and civil service experts selected by the Prime Minister, etc. The composition, organisation, and conduct of the Supreme Council of the Civil Service are determined by the Executive Decree No 17-319 (2 November 2017). However, no information about its meetings or reports exists and in general it appears that this Council has never convened, remaining only a part of legal texts to date.

On the contrary, the central structure of the civil service, a body that has existed since the country's independence and is known as the *General Directorate of the Civil Service and Administrative reform* is active. According to Article 56 of the Civil Service Act, its primary task, among other, is to implement the Civil Service Training and Development Policy and to evaluate human resources policies conducted by public institutions and departments. In our view, the evaluation of the outcomes of this civil service training-related government body, on

---

<sup>22</sup> Among civil servants who, during their career, have obtained higher diplomas and qualifications than their grades or levels (Art. 107, par. 1).

<sup>23</sup> In cases grades are provided by special civil service regulations (Art. 107, par. 2).

<sup>24</sup> Which is mandatory, if promotion means moving directly from one group to another; at least if training is not required in this case, the required diploma must be obtained (Art. 109). As indicated above, civil servants are classified by their education levels into 4 groups: A, B, C and D.

<sup>25</sup> In addition, it is important to note that implementation of this type of training takes place after the adoption of the training programmes, the duration of the training and how to conduct it, through joint ministerial decisions, signed between the Minister in charge of the sector and the authority in charge of the civil service. Our research counted 37 joint ministerial decisions on Complementary training prior to promotion, 19 decisions on preparatory training, and 27 decisions on specialised training (related to recruitment or promotion). Depending on the sector or the grade, the duration of the training varies between 3 to 6 months (short-term), 6 months to 1 year (medium-term) and 1 to 3 years (long-term).

the one hand shows concrete results in the preparation of related laws and regulations, including all decrees and joint ministerial decisions, which we have already referred to and will refer to later. It also ensures that all sectors and public institutions prepare their annual and multi-year training plans and strictly pursue the implementation of mandatory training programmes. On the other hand, we cannot identify concrete contributions of this body in the design of national civil service training policies, which can be relied upon by all sectors, and its activity remains limited only to legal aspects and to the follow-up of the implementation of the minimum mandatory training programmes.

In parallel, we note that all government sectors and their civil service training institutions, separately, are formulating their sectoral policies for training their civil servants, both through annual and multi-year training and development plans (Art. 111), and through all training programmes initiated according to their needs, and which are not exclusively linked to compulsory training. These observations lead to some important results: firstly, the civil service training policies in Algeria are essentially sectoral and separate from each other; and secondly, a unified national strategy in this regard is absent. The only existing strategy is a "strategy aimed at how to ensure the implementation of minimum training", regardless of how these plans are consistent with the development objectives and public policies of the country, and the possibility of drawing on training strategies to contribute to the achievement such national goals and policies.

**c. Key elements of the Civil Service Training Act of Algeria:**

As noted above, Article 105 of the Civil Service Act refers to the by-laws and/or regulations to determine *the conditions of access, the organisational arrangements, the duration of training and development courses and the resulting rights and obligations of civil servants*. Thus, what follows are the main elements of training the civil service in Algeria, other than those already referred to in the Civil Service Act, to avoid repetition. The main references we rely on are the Civil Service Training Act of 2020 and specific civil service decrees for all sectors.<sup>26</sup> The main feature that characterises the civil service training legislation in Algeria is their connection to the civil service acts, as they are just an application tool for the general principles approved by these acts in the field of training.<sup>27</sup>

**Table 2: Algerian legislation relating to civil service training**

Year	Reference	Status
1966	Civil Service Act (Articles 22 and 23)	Repealed
1969	Civil Service Training Act	Repealed
1981	Civil Service Training Abroad Act	Repealed
1987	Civil Service Training Abroad Act	Repealed
1996	Civil Service Training Act	Repealed
2003	Civil Service Training Abroad Act	Repealed
2006	Civil Service Act	In force
2014	Civil Service Training Abroad Act	In force
2020	Civil Service Training Act	In force

<sup>26</sup> As already mentioned, sectoral training is regulated by a very large number of 57 decrees, without counting the implementation decisions, which have been cited as examples above. If all relevant legislation is collected, then, one is confronted with thousands of pages. In this instance, some examples will be mentioned to illustrate the situation.

<sup>27</sup> It is noted that training abroad is a separate issue regulated independently by other legal acts.

The second feature that deserves focus is the fact that these acts are limited to the technical aspects of training, such as its types, procedures for carrying it out, and the privileges it provides to civil servants. Whereas these acts do not address the strategic vision for civil service training, its targeted outcomes, and the training approaches that should be applied. Although they have been continuously modified over the years, these amendments have only dealt with the same technical aspects of the types and procedures of training and the conditions for its conduct. The third feature relates to the exclusion of basic education and considering it as a matter related to the specific civil service acts and acts of the concerned schools and institutions, such as the National School of Administration. The fourth feature is the absence of addressing the issue of governance and leadership training. This category, despite its critical importance, is not considered as such.

In addition to these features, the absence of addressing the question of training evaluation and linking it to specific outcomes that must be achieved in the medium and long term is particularly noted. Despite the positive point of including training within a planning process (annual and multi-year training plan), the Civil Service Training Act of 2020 only stipulates that the authority in charge of civil service assesses the extent to which the training activities included in the plan are implemented and not the extent of its impact on the behaviour of civil servants and management results.

Finally, the Civil Service Training Act of 2020 provides precise classifications and definitions of all types of training directed at the civil service personnel. The terms such as "training" or "development" used in the Civil Service Act, in fact means two different types of training for the civil service, as follows: (1) Training courses, generally referred to a 'pre-service training' and include both 'preparatory training' and 'specialised training', mentioned above;<sup>28</sup> and (2) Development courses, generally referred to as 'in-service training'.<sup>29</sup>

### **Micro-level determinants of Civil Service Training Institutions: Algeria's National School of Administration (ENA) Case Study**

According to Missoum Sbih, the first director of ENA (1964-1978) «*The National School of Administration has never been an academic institution like the others because of the specific mission it has, and because it embodies a conception of the State which implies that those who are called to serve it are specially prepared. It is the place where the spirit of public service is cultivated and where the sense of state begins to be built.*» (Missoum 2004: 11). The establishment of the School was rightly regarded as one of the most important steps taken in the work of building the State in the aftermath of independence. In the minds of its founders, it embodied the desire to build an

---

<sup>28</sup> The first aims to acquire complementary knowledge after recruitment, to confirm the obtained civil servant position, or prior to appointment to a middle management or specialised position (Art. 9 of the Civil Service Training Act of 2020), while the second aims at obtaining theoretical and practical knowledge prior to recruitment or promotion (Art. 8 of the Civil Service Training Act of 2020).

<sup>29</sup> It includes: (a) Training or specialisation studies, which are intended to enable civil servants to acquire new qualifications through a special specialisation aimed at supplementing and/or updating their initial training (Art. 11 of the Civil Service Training Act of 2020); (b) Preparatory training for competitions, examinations or professional tests, which are intended to enable the civil servant to prepare well, and to renew his/her knowledge before the examination (Art. 12); (c) Retraining, seminars and any further development programmes, which are intended to update or improve the qualifications of civil servants or to adapt them to new job requirements.

administration that met the challenges the country was preparing to face in leading the national development processes.

The study of the 'ENA School' model is necessary and crucial to understanding the roots and beginnings of the establishment of the civil service training system in Algeria. First, since it is the first civil service training institution established immediately after independence and was tasked with "*training of innovative civil servants for central and local state departments*",<sup>30</sup> and secondly, in view of its significant contribution to the training of a large number of cadres who contributed to the construction of the Algerian State, particularly during the early years after independence. To illustrate this contribution and the impact ENA has had on society, reference is made, as an example, to the large number of former and current senior officials and leaders who have graduated from it, including, the current President of the Republic, Mr. Abdelmadjid Tebboune, who graduated in 1969.

Is this initial assessment sufficient to judge the impact of this school, in the country's civil service training system and overall governance system, more than half a century after its establishment? The answer, of course, is not easy, and requires a deeper examination of the achievements made according to the context in which they evolved, and according to the criteria mentioned above, as well as the comparison we are seeking to make with the Chinese model.

#### *a. ENA, a half-century backward look: Key milestones, roles, and training system*

Since its creation, the National School of Administration has been involved in the implementation of civil service training policy. The role assigned to ENA was to ensure - in the context of initial training - the preparation of officials for the designated jobs they were called upon to occupy in the central administrations and the external services of the State. Its role also extended to providing specialised training to senior staff in major ministries, namely Foreign Affairs, Justice, Interior Affairs, Finance and to other service personnel in the sectoral administrations.

The legal texts governing ENA contain two types of regulations. On the one hand, the founding legal Act of 1964 (Decree 64-155) that focuses on three main issues: the mission of the school, the supervising authority, and the basic principles of its operation. The core provisions of this Decree are still in force to date; however, they have been amended several times. On the other hand, the legal Act of 2006 (Decree 06-419) that focuses on the management, training, and study system legal. The Act's provisions inaugurated a new phase of the school's management and training system; the first time since 1966 (Decree 66-306) that marked the beginning of the initial phase of ENA.

First, regarding the mission of ENA, we note one of its key tasks has not changed to this day: "*Training innovative civil servants for central departments and external departments of the State*". In 1971, ENA's tasks were enriched with the addition of "*contribution to the training of judges*". At the same time, a '*Research and Documentation Center on Administration*' was established to launch research on administration and publish their findings, as well as contribute to the implementation of studies, and exchanges with similar national and international organisations. The Executive Decree of 2006 redrafted and summarised the mission of the

---

<sup>30</sup> Article 1 of Decree No. 64-155, which includes the founding of ENA.

school in the following areas: (1) provide training for designated cadres according to the needs of state administration, local authorities and public institutions; (2) organise development and training activities for management staff of public institutions and administrations; (3) develop studies and research activities in the field of administration, as well as provide audit and advisory services to the benefit of public institutions and administrations; and (4) participate in national and international programmes and networks of training and research institutions.

Second, with respect to the supervisory authority and the mechanisms of management, we note the instability in the school-supervised authority (see table 3 below), which however has not affected its overall management arrangements and its financial independence. It still is (1) a deliberative body headed by its supervising authority (board of directors), which comprises all the key ministries and bodies of the government; (2) an executive body headed by the Director-General of the School; and (3) a Scientific Council.<sup>31</sup>

**Table 3: ENA’s supervisory authorities over time**

Year	Reference	Supervisory authority
1964	Decree 64-155	President’s Office
1966	Decree 66-306 (art. 57)	Ministry of Interior
1982	Decree 82-250	Secretary of State for Civil Service and Administrative Reform
1984	Decree 84-35	Prime Minister
1987	Decree 87-270	Ministry of Higher Education
2005	Presidential Decree 05-440	Ministry of Interior and Local Authorities

Third, the school's education and training system may historically be divided in two different stages: The first stage starting with the school's establishment in 1964 and ending in 2006. During this stage, enrolment took place through rigorous competitions, in which young people with a baccalaureate (secondary education certificate) competed. Those who were successful in passing the examinations were subject to four (4) years of training, after which they graduated with the "ENA Diploma". The Diploma was equivalent to the Bachelor's degree. In the second - current - stage beginning with the adoption of Executive Decree No 06-440, the entry competition for the school has been opened to those with a Bachelor's degree. Successful candidates are then trained for three (3) years, after which they graduate with the "ENA new system Diploma".

Whether under the new or old system, ENA’s content of training is characterised by a combination of theoretical and applied studies. After the end of each academic year, students are placed as trainees to acquire practical experience in real working conditions, in the central or local public departments or companies. Trainees produce research reports, discussed at the end of the year, and counted as a key part of their assessment. In addition to the permanent faculty members, the school can hire visiting professors from the country’s high cadres, in

---

<sup>31</sup> The Director-General of the School at the 'Governor' level, the Secretary-General of the School, at the level of the Head of the Cabinet of the Ministry, and the Directors (Department of Studies, Department of Internship, Department of continuous Training and Cooperation, Centre for Documentation and Research), at the level of Directors, and heads of services at the level of Deputy Director of the Ministry (Arts. 27, 28 and 29 of Executive Decree 06-440). Finally, it should be noted that several branches of the school can be established (Decree 82-250), but this is not currently in force, except the experience of applying this for a few years in the past, but this has not been long-lasting. Since 2006, the status of the leadership position at ENA was raised to the same level as ministries.

order to contribute to enriching the contents of the training with elements of practical experience as they are in the real world. This can be done by assisting permanent faculty members in preparing and updating the educational content to suit current needs and challenges of public administration, as well as by providing training activities that include simulations of real business scenarios.<sup>32</sup>

***b. ENA's role in research and consultation***

It is assumed that training, research, and consultancy on operational issues are all part of an integrated process and not three distinct ones. Thus, ENA conducts its training, research, and consultancy functions simultaneously. This means that its work is not restricted its role in the design and conduct of training courses, but it also undertakes research on problems of the government and provides consultancy on operational issues. However, regardless of what is officially stated as ENA's competences in this area, we must examine the efficiency and effectiveness of research and consultation issues in terms of their quality, nature, and most importantly their results and application. We try to address this matter, using a few available data and reports.

According to Essaïd Taïb, Permanent Professor at ENA of Algeria, *"Research on administration is undermined at ENA by the lack of graduate studies of a doctoral level. And yet this School has had an Administrative Research and Documentation Centre (CDRA) since 1971. Apart from the creation of the journal IDARA in 1991, the activity of this Centre is limited to conducting a documentary activity and organising some scientific events. Moreover, the journal 'Intégration', common to the ENAs of the Maghreb countries, ceased to appear."* (Essaïd 1998:364). He assumed that *"Most of the work deals with administration from the point of view of administrative law with a focus on the following topics: civil service, finance, litigation, administrative institutions. This work does not provide much insight into administration from an administrative science or management perspective."*

With regard to "consultations", other writers argued that public administrations were not interested in requesting such consultations. On this point, Mr. Hocine Cherhabil, a former Director-General of ENA, asserted that *"Progress is undoubtedly still to be made with a view to systematising the use of consultation in the various areas of administrative action. These advances are, it seems, dependent on developments within the administration itself. They begin to emerge with the awareness, by the administration, of the need to organise the conditions for a permanent reflection on its own practices, as well as the need to have sufficient hindsight to allow objective observation by external observers."* (Cherhabil 2004: 27).<sup>33</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> Articles 31 and 32 of the Executive Decree No 06-419.

<sup>33</sup> We add to these testimonies the recommendations of the December 2018 International Forum on «Governance Capacity Building» held on 4 and 5 December 2018 in Algiers, jointly organised by the China National Academy of Governance (CNAG) and the Algerian Ministry of Interior, Local Authorities and Territorial Planning (MILATP), which devoted a panel entitled "Give full play to the dual functions of scientific research and decision-making consultation in schools of governance/public administration, to enhance public service capacity". All attendees from Algeria, China and other participating countries concluded that the main weakness of the Algerian system of public service schools is the absence of the research and consultation functions and the need to develop them systematically aimed at enhancing the efficiency of the governance system. The participants also recommended to take advantage of leading experiences such as the CNAG and other Chinese civil service training institutions to gain time, locate the factors of their success and how they are embodied in an integrated training, research and consulting system that works in parallel with government policies and contributes to the development of plans, strategies, and policy evaluation.

## DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

This study has highlighted that comparative analysis of experiences in civil service training is very important to draw lessons and discern the differences in experiences of different countries. Training of the civil service remains an important area for future cooperation, both between different countries of the world and between China and Algeria, given the growing strategic links between the two countries.

### **The realistic basis for China and Algeria to carry out civil service training cooperation**

China and Algeria have a profound friendship in history and have always supported and cooperated with each other.<sup>34</sup> In 2014, Algeria became the first Arab country to establish a comprehensive strategic partnership, a strong indication of the close relationship between the two sides. After China's Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) was put forward, it received enthusiastic response from Algeria, and Algerian officials have always stressed the importance of jointly promoting the construction of the BRI. In 2018, the two countries signed a memorandum of understanding, which reflected Algeria's recognition of China's development experience and its willingness to cooperate with each other, a powerful spiritual driving force for the two countries to jointly build the BRI.

In addition, Algeria is relatively stable among many African and Arab countries and has not been much impacted by the Arab Spring. Algeria is also a driving force for regional stability, playing the role of the mediator in regional conflicts, a role affirmed by the international community and many African countries. However, the Algerian government also recognises that its social development faces many problems and is seeking to find a development path suitable for its national conditions.

Although the training of civil servants in China started late, it is well integrated with domestic development achievements and international advanced experience. A training system with Chinese characteristics has been formed. For Algeria, which has similar national conditions, similar ideologies and close hearts and minds with China, there are many Chinese experiences that can be naturally absorbed and used for reference. It can help Algeria to form a training system for civil servants with its own characteristics and provide a solid organisational guarantee for the effective governance of the country.

### **Comparison of the training systems of civil servants between the two countries**

Several similarities exist in the training systems of civil servants in the two countries. For example, both the Civil Service Law and the Civil Service Training Regulation have been formulated, which guarantee the right of all civil servants to receive training. The training types are basically the same, and training is linked with promotion assessments in both countries. There are also common problems such as insufficient evaluation of the ultimate training effect, which reflect the similarities in how training concepts are formed by the teams in charge of training policy in both countries. Furthermore, obvious difference exist in the

---

<sup>34</sup> Since 1950s, the two countries have formed a special partnership. Following the establishment of Algeria's interim government in September 1958, China recognized it and was the first non-Arab country to recognise Algeria. From the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, cooperation between China and Algeria has developed more rapidly, gradually becoming more strategic in nature.

training of civil servants between the two countries, which are attributed to different national conditions and development stages of each country.

### *(1) Differences in the classification of civil servants*

Algeria classifies its civil servants into four groups – A, B, C, and D - according to their education level that are also split into senior, intermediate and junior civil servants according to their hierarchical level classification. Overall, civil service positions are mainly classified by education level, i.e., possessing a university degree, relevant academic certificates and/or training certificates. These are necessary prerequisites for taking up positions at corresponding level.

Conversely, most Chinese civil servants have already acquired at least a bachelor's degree or higher and possess a solid political sense when sitting the entrance examination. Thus, Chinese civil servants are not classified according to their education level but along three categories in congruence with the nature of their work: comprehensive managers, professional technicians, and administrative law enforcers. At the vertical level, there are three categories: central, provincial, and local government. At the functional operation level, there are three categories: strategic decision-making, supervision management and executive operation. At the job sequence level, there are three levels: primary level (below section level), intermediate level (division level) and senior level (department level and above). The training content is tailored for different categories, functions, and levels of civil servants, with different emphasis depending on the functional level of the jobs they perform.

### *(2) Differences in the management framework of civil servant training*

Algeria's Civil Service and Civil Service Training Acts and other national laws and regulations contain general provisions on the basic aspects of civil servant training, such as the content and methods. However, the regulations are too general, and they do not cover all aspects of the training. Specific implementation still depends on each department to formulate detailed by-laws and regulations on their own, resulting to large differences in training between departments and difficulties for unified management. Furthermore, although the legislation provides for the establishment of a national authority for civil service training, this has not been set up. This is another reason why training practices of civil servants in Algeria are characterised by many irregular and inconsistent management issues.

China has promulgated relevant laws and regulations such as the Civil Service Law, the Regulation on Cadre Education and Training, and the Regulation on Civil Servants Training at the national level. Every five years, the government issues a national civil servants training plan, which contains comprehensive and concrete arrangements for all aspects and stages of civil servants training and provides clear guidelines for the national CET. The Central Organization Department is responsible for the overall management and planning of CET throughout the country. Party committees and governments at all levels are responsible for organizing the education and training of cadres at their own levels, giving priority to underdeveloped areas and ethnic minority areas. Thus, realising the goals for education and training of cadres throughout the country and meeting the needs of talents who implement the principles and policies of the CPC and the state.

### *(3) The emphasis of civil servants' training content is different*

The training of Algerian civil servants calls for the training of senior civil servants in leadership, strategic development ability and other governance abilities. However, it is also necessary to provide training in basic public management competencies and skills to B-, C-, and D-level civil servants. Moreover, the training of civil servants in Algeria is not closely related to the country's overall policies and development process, thus its role in promoting the country's development needs to be further improved.

China's civil servants are an important component of the cadre team and the core force governing the country. The recruitment of civil servants in China adheres to the principle of "every candidate being based on testes", which ensures the high quality of civil servants at the start. Most civil servants possess a bachelor's degree or higher, as well as sound political quality, and thus they are not lacking basic knowledge and skills required in entering the civil service. The Chinese President Xi Jinping has put forward the requirement of building a good cadre team with firm faith, serving the people, diligent and pragmatic, daring to take responsibility, being honest and clean. Based on this, the standard of "having both ability and political integrity and putting morality first" is highlighted in the selection and employment of Chinese civil servants. Civil servants have high ideals and beliefs and a public servant consciousness. To be loyal and clean means to have morality and qualified political quality. At the same time, it is necessary to possess sufficient governance ability, that is, to have "talents", so as to realize the purpose of "serving the people and being diligent and pragmatic". Therefore, the training of Chinese civil servants pays attention to both ability and political integrity, puts morality first, puts political quality first, and at the same time closely focuses on the central tasks of the CPC and the country in different periods, and vigorously cultivates and improves their governance ability.

### *(4) The maturity of the function of training, research and consultation is different*

China's civil service training institutions at all levels and types are responsible for the training of all civil servants. At the same time, they also actively engaged in academic research centres and think tanks and pay attention to gathering the wisdom of trainees and promoting research and consultation. Conversely, Algerian training institutions such as the National School of Administration (ENA) also have a research department, but this department has not played an active research function and the role of senior officials is not prominent.

### **Three major lessons might be useful for Algeria**

#### **First, strengthening the top-level design and institutional guarantee of civil servant training.**

In addition to formulating unified, standardised and comprehensive laws and regulations, the state should formulate short-, medium-, and long-term civil servant training work plans, and clearly stipulate all aspects of the training objectives of cadres in a certain stage of the country to ensure the unity and continuity of civil servant training programmes. Furthermore, establishing a vertical network composed of institutes at the central to the local government levels, and establishing a horizontal network composed of self-established training institutions in different industries, universities, private institutions, and overseas entrusted training, to improve the scale, efficiency, pertinence, and integrity of civil servant training. In addition, Algeria should attach importance to the function of training qualified civil servant candidates in academies and universities, select more outstanding graduates from public management

majors, government management and other related majors in academies and universities to the civil service, support civil servants to study for MPA and other professional degrees on the job, and strengthen civil servants' on-the-job training and online learning, to effectively improve the academic structure and ability level of civil servants.

**The second is to strengthen the training of senior civil servants.** Judging from the current materials, the training of Algerian civil servants focuses on the training of basic competencies and skills, while training on strategic planning ability, leadership, and international vision of senior and middle-level civil servants is insufficient. Of course, this limitation is determined by the reality of the knowledge and ability structure of the civil service in the country. Nevertheless, in addition to large-scale implementation of basic ability training, training of senior civil servants on acquiring governance capacities is also necessary. Algeria needs to intensify the training of senior civil servants in leadership and strategic planning ability. China's experience in this field may be of good reference to Algeria. China's relevant training contents can also be applied to Algeria, such as economic and social development ability, administration according to law ability, emergency management ability, new development concept of "innovation, coordination, green, openness and sharing" and training on "overall national security concept".<sup>35</sup>

**The third is to deepen the research and consultation capabilities of training institutions.** It is suggested that the Algerian side strengthens the research and consulting functions of civil servants training institutions, make great efforts to add research departments or research functions to training institutions, enrol more researchers, improve the research requirements and project support for teaching and research personnel, set up links for trainees in training programmes for joint research and discussion, establish a smoother supply and demand mechanism for decision-making consultation with the government, communicate with foreign counterparts including the CCPS (CNAG) to understand and learn about their mechanisms for research and consultation, and carry out joint research projects with them.

## REFERENCES

- Sang Ningxia, Liu Ketong (2020) Research on the Development of Cadre Education Policy in the past 70 Years in New China [J]. Contemporary Continuing Education, 2020 (2): 11-17.
- The Break between Ci Zhigang's Tradition and Modern Society -On the Root of Algeria's Political Crisis [J] Research on Middle East Issues, 2015 (02): 41-63 +281
- Lu Yingbo's Main Challenges Facing Algeria at Present [J] Country and Regional Studies, 2018 (2): 110-118
- Research on CET of the Party School of the Central Committee of CPC in Hu Bing's New Era [D] Beijing: Party School of the CPC Central Committee (China National Academy of Governance), 2019
- A Comparative Study of Civil Servant Training between China and Major Western Developed Countries in Ming Dynasty [D] Nanchang: Jiangxi Normal University, 2006

---

<sup>35</sup> The Chinese President Xi Jinping put forward "adhering to the overall national security concept and embarking on a safe road with Chinese characteristics". The term "overall national security" means that national security is regarded as a complex system. We must attach importance to both external and internal security; attach importance to both homeland and national security; pay attention to both traditional and non-traditional security.

- He Shaoxiong from Ideological Community to Destiny Community-A Study on the Relationship between China and Algeria (Up to now) [D] Shanghai: Shanghai International Studies University, 2017
- Zhou Wenzhang's Research on Civil Servant Training [M] Beijing: National Academy of Governance Press, 2014
- Wang Jinyan Friendly Cooperation between China and Algeria [M] Beijing: China Social Sciences Press, 2019
- Alam, M. M. (1990). Civil service training and development: Assessing the role and significance of higher civil service training in less developed countries. Administrative Development Agency.
- Cherhabil, H. (2004). L'école nationale d'administration: Quarante ans au service de l'Etat. *Revue de L'Ecole Nationale d'Administration*, 14(1), 17–32.
- Essaïd, T. (1998). La réforme de l'administration en Algérie. *Annuaire de l'Afrique du Nord*, Centre national de la recherche scientifique; Institut de recherches et d'études sur le monde arabe et musulman (IREMAM), XXXV, 343–377.
- Kerrigan, J. E., & Luke, J. S. (1987). *Management training strategies for developing countries*. L. Rienner Publishers.
- McGregor Jr, E. B., & Solano, P. (1994). Comparative Civil Service Research: The Strategic Agenda. *Comparative Public Management: Putting US Public Policy and Implementation in Context*, 93.
- Missoum, S. (2004). Discours de remerciement de monsieur Missoum SBIH. *Revue de L' Ecole Nationale d' Administration*, 14(1), 11–12.